


City of Alexandria, Virginia

12
12-11-01

MEMORANDUM

DATE: NOVEMBER 30, 2001

TO: THE HONORABLE MAYOR AND MEMBERS OF CITY COUNCIL

FROM: PHILIP SUNDERLAND, CITY MANAGER 

SUBJECT: REPORT OF THE ALEXANDRIA HISTORICAL RESTORATION
AND PRESERVATION COMMISSION

ISSUE: Receipt of the report of the Alexandria Historical Restoration and Preservation Commission.

RECOMMENDATION: That City Council receive the report of the Alexandria Historical Restoration and Preservation Commission and thank the members for their efforts on behalf of the City.

DISCUSSION: This report covers the period from October 1998 through October 2001. This Commission was created by the Commonwealth of Virginia in partnership with the City of Alexandria to assist in preserving the historic character of our City. Two of the members of the Commission are appointed directly by the Governor; five are appointed by City Council. The Commission accepts easements on open space, and architecturally significant interior and exterior elements. On October 14, 2000, City Council authorized an amendment to the Code of the City of Alexandria to extend the area from which easements may be accepted. Originally the area was limited to the Old and Historic District, but the amendment increased that area to include the entire City. An attachment to the report lists all of the properties in the City currently protected with easements.

The Commission has participated in preservation issues in three major program areas. The first of these is advocacy. Members testify in planning, zoning and architectural review proceedings, especially when issues affect the preservation of open space. The Commission also participated in the review of plans for the Woodrow Wilson Bridge replacement project. The Commission focused attention on efforts to monitor and obtain mitigation measures. The Commission continues to express concern on the projected substantial increase in the traffic load on streets in the Historic Districts. Members of the Commission participated with the Coalition for a Sensible Bridge in various legal proceedings with the Circuit Court of Appeals for the District of Columbia, the full Circuit Court, a petition was also sent to the Supreme Court of the United States.

The Easement Program is discussed in the second part of the Commission Report. Since its last report, there are several significant properties that have been protected by easements, held by the Commission as well as the State Department of Historic Resources. These include the Lee-Fendall House, the Alexandria Academy, the Lloyd House, and the garden on the Potts-Fitzhugh House [Lee Boyhood Home]. The Commission plans to hold a public seminar to discuss the issues surrounding easements on historic properties on February 23, 2002 at The Lyceum.

The planned rehabilitation of Lloyd House is another major focus of the Commission. Lloyd House is owned by the Commission and members have participated in meetings with a working committee first on the development of the Historic Structures Report, and now on the plans for the buildings rehabilitation. RKTects Studio prepared the Historic Structures Report that guides the plan for the work. Drawings have been completed and it is expected that the work will begin sometime in early 2002. The re-use of the building will provide for code required changes that include a first floor ADA accessible restroom, a sprinkler system, support for the interior stairway, and reinforcement of the walls and flooring. Once the work has been completed, the administration division of the Office of Historic Alexandria will occupy parts of the building. The first floor, as well as the garden, will be available for public and private meetings, receptions and parties.

Funds for the rehabilitation come from the State of Virginia (\$60,000), the City of Alexandria CIP (\$480,000), and most recently a special appropriation from "Save America's Treasures," a federal program under the National Endowment for the Arts and the National Park Service. This special appropriation in the amount of \$125,000 was requested by Congressman James Moran.

FISCAL IMPACT: None

ATTACHMENT: Report of the Alexandria Historical Restoration and Preservation Commission

STAFF: Jean Taylor Federico, Director,
Office of Historic Alexandria

**THE ALEXANDRIA HISTORICAL RESTORATION AND
PRESERVATION COMMISSION**

Office of Historic Alexandria
Box 178 City Hall
Alexandria, VA 22313

**REPORT TO THE CITY COUNCIL
Covering the Period
October 1998 – October 2001**

Kerry J. Donley, Mayor
William C. Cleveland, Vice Mayor
Claire M. Eberwein, Councilwoman
William D. Euille, Councilman
Redella S. Pepper, Councilwoman
David G. Speck, Councilman
Joyce Woodson, Councilwoman
Philip Sunderland, City Manager

Advocacy

In addition to pursuing in the public arena policies and programs for the continued protection of the Lloyd House and promoting government-private partnerships in the easements program, the Commission has been heavily involved in advocating preservation interests in other contexts. One of these has been to take positions and testify in planning, zoning, and architectural review proceedings, especially when issues arise affecting the preservation of open space that has been a defining feature of the historic character of our Historic Districts. The other principal context has been in the various proceedings dealing with the planning and, now, the construction phase of the Wilson Bridge replacement project.

Our advocacy before the Planning Commission, Board of Zoning Appeals, Board of Architectural Review, and the City Council, on appeals, complements our efforts in the easements program. Those efforts are directed at preserving the open space that is an integral part of the combination of architecture and layout that makes up the character of Alexandria's historic districts.

The position of the Commission is that the Historic District's character is much more than the simple sum of the architectural features imbedded in the structures themselves. Other important aspects include how these structures relate to each other and to the whole in terms of their spacing, their relative positions in the street- and block-scapes, their ages, their associated plantings, and their different uses. A critical criterion in this advocacy has been whether proposed property additions or modifications contribute to or detract from the residents' and visitors' sense of being transported into Alexandria's rich history.

A corollary in the Commission's advocacy on these issues is that focusing narrowly on the impact of a single proposal that may be pending is not sufficiently farsighted. In many cases, the precedent that is set may be equally, or even more, important to the ultimate impacts they may have. For example, the Commission continues to take a stand opposing large additions onto the main block of historic residences into prominent, long standing side gardens. Open side gardens have been a significant defining feature of Alexandria. Where the Commission holds an easement on the property, we have been successful in maintaining the integrity of that space. However, where we do not hold an easement, that critical effort to resist increasing the density of construction and to maintain the open character of our historic areas requires active cooperation on the part of City Council and other Boards and Commissions in the City. Our efforts to preserve the openness characteristic of the historic areas should be viewed as a major complementary component of the City's current concern for open space within the City in general.

Making Alexandria's rich history available authentically should be reason enough to spur on these preservation efforts but we are also fully aware that preserving Alexandria's historic character has very important economic consequences for property values and tourism. Independent studies for the City and other jurisdictions support the contention that Alexandria's special historic character is a major underpinning for much economic activity in the City.

The same preservation principles have been the basis for the Commission's very strong

involvement with the planning process and, now, the construction phase of the Woodrow Wilson Bridge replacement project. The Commission's focus is currently directed primarily at cooperating with and supporting efforts to monitor and obtain mitigation measures. These are directed at where it is possible to avoid the very detrimental visual, environmental, and physical effects that the Historic District is suffering and will suffer in the longer term as a consequence of the bridge replacement. Our concern includes the projected, very substantial increase in the traffic load on the streets of the Historic Districts, which will detract from their character and the visitor experience.

The Commission's involvement has included working with the Coalition for a Sensible Bridge, a grassroots organization of individuals and citizens' groups that has continued in operation since the completion of our litigation efforts. It maintains contacts with members of both the Congress and the Virginia General Assembly, as well as with relevant offices in the City government, the U.S. Department of Transportation, the Federal Highway Administration, and the Maryland and Virginia state highway authorities.

The lawsuit, originally filed in Federal District Court by the City in late 1998 and joined by the Commission and other citizen groups, sought relief from the FHWA planning process on five counts. Judge Stanley Sporkin heard the case in March 1999, just a few days after the City announced that it had reached a settlement with the defendants and therefore had withdrawn from the suit. In his April decision, Judge Sporkin found for plaintiffs on all five counts contained in the original filing. The FHWA filed an appeal in July 1999 to the Circuit Court of Appeals for the District of Columbia on four of those counts and proposed to remedy the deficiency that Judge Sporkin found in its air emissions impact study and conclusions, the fifth count. The Circuit Court held its hearing later in the year and reversed Judge Sporkin on all four counts. Counsel to the Commission and other remaining plaintiffs filed for a rehearing by the full Circuit Court but that was denied in early 2000. Counsel proceeded to file a petition for *certiorari* of the case to the Supreme Court of the United States but it was not granted for its fall 2000 session. For the time being, at least, there do not appear to be any additional issues that the parties believe should be taken to litigation on the Woodrow Wilson Bridge replacement project.

Easement Program

Under its charter, the Commission accepts easements on open spaces, structures, facades, and/or interiors of properties throughout Alexandria. Including those held by other authorized easement grantee organizations, there are now thirty-five such easements. Approximately one-half of these is held wholly or in-part by the Commission. Other easement grantees in Alexandria include the Virginia Board of Historic Resources, the Virginia Historic Landmarks Commission, the Historic Alexandria Foundation, and the L'Enfant Trust. A list of known easements in Old Town is attached to this report.

The Commission has identified over fifty properties for which we believe open space easements would be most appropriate. We are in the process of encouraging the owners of these properties to consider offering such easements. Open space, particularly that representative of the historic character of Old Town, is at a high and increasing premium. That type of easement is our highest priority.

Since our last report, easements have been granted on several important properties such as the Lee-Fendall House, the Alexandria Academy, the Robert E. Lee Boyhood Home and the Lloyd House. Also, it was during that time that the Commission's charter was amended to extend the area from within which we are permitted to accept easements. Originally, the area was limited to the Old and Historic District but the amendment increased that area to include the entire City. The Commission plans to increase actively its efforts accordingly to include appropriate properties in other historic districts within the City and other individual properties of historic significance outside the historic districts.

To encourage property owners to consider the benefits of these easements to the City and to themselves, the Commission plans to join with the Historic Alexandria Foundation in sponsoring a seminar on easements later this year or early in 2002. It will cover various features of easements and the process that is followed to develop and record them, including property definition, appraisals, tax benefits, and the resale of property under easement. A similar program was held in 1998. The Office of Historic Alexandria will provide support for the program.

Lloyd House

During this period there has been considerable progress on the plans for the renovation at Lloyd House. The Historic Structures Report was completed by the architectural firm, RKTects. A member of the Commission participated in the selection of the architect for the project, Eleanor Krause, of RKTects. In recent months Eleanor Krause and the consultant, Richard Bierce, have prepared plans for re-use of the building in order to provide for code required changes. These include a first floor ADA accessible restroom, a sprinkler system, changes to the basement stairs, support for the main interior stairway, reinforcement of the walls and flooring. All of this work must be accomplished with little or no loss to the historic fabric of the building. At the Commission meeting in September, Ms. Krause presented a plan for re-use of the space which met with full approval of the Commission. Members will now consider issues such as lighting and other design related concepts, particularly for the first floor which will include space for public meetings. The Commonwealth of Virginia, through the Department of Historic Resources, has given \$60,000 towards the project. The Department of Historic Resources required an easement on the Lloyd House structure, only. This easement was granted by the Commission. Additional requests were made last year, but were not awarded because of budget related issues. The City of Alexandria is funding a significant portion of the costs for this renovation through the Capital Improvement Plan, over a three year period. A recent request to the NEA federal grant program, "Save America's Treasures" was not successful. However, Congressman James Moran introduced a special appropriation for \$125,000 through the "Save Americas Treasures" program after the fact. This appropriation was successful and the funds are now available for the renovation project.

Operational costs for the Lloyd House will be funded from the Office of Historic Alexandria, with additional support possible through the rental of the building and garden for special events on an occasional basis. The downstairs spaces will be available for small meetings and receptions.

Respectfully submitted:

A handwritten signature in cursive script, appearing to read "Charles Trozzo".

Charles Trozzo, Chairman

Charles Ablard

Philip Brooks

Polly Burke

Emily Davies

Jeffery Epperson

Cassandra Bradley Fitzpatrick

City of Alexandria, Virginia
PROPERTIES ENCUMBERED BY PRESERVATION EASEMENT AS OF JANUARY 1, 2001

Property Location Address	Owner's Name	Date of Donation	Donee	Type of Easement	Map-Block-Lot	Before Easement	After Easement	% Adjustment For Easement
1 Alfred St. S. 115	Hartsook, Elizabeth H.	09/23/1999	Alexandria Historical Restoration & Preservation Commission	exterior open space easement	74.01-06-14	422,900	363,700	14%
2 Alfred St. S. 117	Hartsook, Elizabeth H.	09/23/1999	Alexandria Historical Restoration & Preservation Commission	exterior open space easement	74.01-06-15	392,700	337,700	14%
3 Cameron St. 211	Weinhagen, Robert & Dowling, L. J.	12/19/1996	Alexandria Historical Restoration & Preservation Commission	easement in gross (exterior & interior)	65.03-09-18	825,100	651,800	21%
4 Cameron St. 607	Arair, John H. & Leslie S.	07/19/1994	Alexandria Historical Restoration & Preservation Commission	easement in gross (8' wide strip along street boundary lines)	64.04-08-14	2,455,100	2,356,900	4%
5 Duke St. 208	MacManis, Elizabeth Tr. et al	05/12/1991	Commonwealth of Va., Virginia Board of Historic Resources & Historic Alexandria Foundation, Inc.	easement in gross (exterior & interior)	75.03-06-06	1,368,700	1,081,200	21%
6 Duke St. 516	Rodriguez, Karol K.	09/03/1993	Alexandria Historical Restoration & Preservation Commission	exterior open space easement	74.04-04-17	1,012,400	941,500	7%
7 Fairfax St. S. 209	Fowler, Trudve H.	09/25/1997	Alexandria Historical Restoration & Preservation Commission	open space & architectural facade easement	75.03-01-01	1,298,400	1,116,600	14%
8 Franklin St. 207	Ginsburg, David	12/26/1969	Virginia Historic Landmarks Commission	easement in gross	81.01-02-13-0	351,700	263,800	25%
9 Jefferson St. 215	Laurent, Margaret F. G., Tr.	12/05/1991	Commonwealth of Va. & Virginia Board of Historic Resources	easement in gross	80.04-02-39	1,605,700	1,204,300	25%
10 Jefferson St. 215A	Laurent, Margaret F. G., Tr.	12/05/1991	Commonwealth of Va. & Virginia Board of Historic Resources	easement in gross	81.03-01-17	55,600	41,700	25%
11 Lee St. S. 218	Hoffman, Robert Dertiz & Martina	06/10/1992	Alexandria Historical Restoration & Preservation Commission	easement in gross	75.03-02-04	1,076,900	850,700	21%
12 Lee St. S. 310	Wilbor, Jonathan & Peggy	12/24/1992	Alexandria Historical Restoration & Preservation Commission	easement in gross	75.03-05-20	1,379,300	1,034,500	25%
13 Lee St. S. 401	Kegan, Lawrence, Tr.	02/21/1991	Alexandria Historical Restoration & Preservation Commission	interior space & architectural facade easement	75.03-07-08	781,300	750,100	4%
14 Lee St. S. 418	Dunn, H. Steward & Lori	11/20/1991	Alexandria Historical Restoration & Preservation Commission & Historic Alexandria Foundation, Inc.	open space & architectural facade easement	75.03-08-29	1,620,300	1,393,400	14%
15 Lee St. S. 420	MacDonald, William & Elizabeth	10/24/1994	Alexandria Historical Restoration & Preservation Commission & Historic Alexandria Foundation, Inc.	easement in gross	75.03-08-28	973,400	730,100	25%
16 Lee St. S. 428	Devine, Margaret M. M. & Stephen W	12/21/1983	The L'Enfant Trust	open space & facade easement	75.03-08-25	602,200	566,100	6%
17 Lee St. S. 617	Ginsburg, David	12/26/1969	Virginia Historic Landmarks Commission	easement in gross	81.01-02-13	3,491,900	2,618,900	25%
18 Oronoco 607	Kington, Mark J. & Ann A.	12/04/2000	Alexandria Historical Restoration & Preservation Commission	open space easement	64.02-04-03	653,600	490,200	25%
19 Pitt St. S. 229	Dabney, Thomas & Karen	12/30/1986	Virginia Historic Landmarks Board & Historic Alexandria Foundation, Inc.	easement in gross	74.04-04-12	1,184,800	1,018,900	14%
20 Prince St. 207	Montague, Robert L. III	12/04/1979	Virginia Historic Landmarks Board & Historic Alexandria Foundation, Inc.	easement in gross	75.01-07-15	1,937,300	1,453,000	25%
21 Prince St. 413	Von Sternberg, Carl & Janet	12/11/1987	Virginia Historic Landmarks Board	easement in gross	74.02-07-11-03	920,100	726,900	21%
22 Prince St. 415	Von Sternberg, Carl & Janet	12/11/1987	Virginia Historic Landmarks Board	easement in gross (exterior & certain interior)	74.02-07-11-02	2,014,400	1,591,400	21%
23 Prince St. 415 1/2	Von Sternberg, Carl & Janet	12/11/1987	Virginia Historic Landmarks Board	easement in gross (exterior)	74.02-07-11-01	352,100	278,100	21%
24 Prince St. 507	Cooper, Ronald & Carolyn	12/08/1982	The L'Enfant Trust	exterior facade easement (south wall)	74.02-08-07	992,500	984,100	1%
25 Prince St. 711	Rigler, Robert E. & Maeve T.	06/03/1987	Virginia Historic Landmarks Board	easement in gross	74.02-10-18	2,378,200	1,783,600	25%
26 Prince St. 811	Sturdevant, Annette K.	07/02/1986	Virginia Historic Landmarks Board & Historic Alexandria Foundation, Inc.	easement in gross (exterior & first floor interior)	74.02-11-18	1,154,600	912,100	21%
27 Prince St. 1020	Thompson, Evelina Tr.	12/14/1989	Alexandria Historical Restoration & Preservation Commission & Historic Alexandria Foundation, Inc.	open space & architectural facade easement	74.01-08-01	687,000	590,800	14%
28 Queen St. 518	Ifovey, Richard B. & Bradley, A. J.	12/29/1990	Alexandria Historical Restoration & Preservation Commission	front yard	64.04-09-05	335,900	315,800	6%
29 Queen St. 520 & 522	Saunders, Lelia B.	05/09/1990	Alexandria Historical Restoration & Preservation Commission	open space easement	64.04-09-03&04	633,500	544,900	14%
30 Royal St. S. 211	Bennett, Paul M. & Ann J.	08/01/1996	Alexandria Historical Restoration & Preservation Commission	interior woodwork easement	74.02-16-18	656,700	652,100	1%
31 St. Asaph St. S. 223	Oxenhandler, Donald C.	12/16/1986	Virginia Historic Landmarks Board & Historic Alexandria Foundation, Inc.	easement in gross (exterior & first floor interior)	74.02-14-07	2,096,000	1,572,000	25%
32 St. Asaph St. S. 301	Mulford, David C. & Jeannie S.	08/13/1970	Historic Alexandria Foundation, Inc.	easement in gross (exterior & interior woodwork)	74.04-03-03	2,489,400	1,867,100	25%
1 Queen St. 607	Clizbe, John A. & Rebecca	11/13/1997	City of Alexandria, Virginia	interior encapsulated wall	64.04-11-07	530,400	530,400	0%
2 Pitt St. S. 700	Olson, Richard L. & Janice C.	04/13/1965	Alexandria Redevelopment & Housing Authority	covenants on exterior walls of structure	80.02-08-16	1,179,100	1,179,100	0%
3 Oronoco St. 614	Va. Trust For Historic Preservation, Inc	07/29/1999	Commonwealth of Va., Board of Historic Resources & Va. Trust For Historic Preservation	easement in gross (exterior & interior)	64.02-09-01	1,452,300	1,089,200	14%

Department of Real Estate Assessments, January 16, 2001
file name: j:\2001\av\ballen\reports\01\premits.wk4 Tab B (donee)

1 - prior owner was Peter Schumauer
2 - prior owner was Charles Ablard
3 - prior owner was Howard Stahl

* Updated as of October 4, 2001, by Office of Historic Alexandria.

604 Wolfe Street - Historic Alex. Foundation - Commonwealth of Va. & Virginia Bd. of H.R. - Alex. Academy
220 N. Washington St. - Alex. Historical Restoration & Preservation Comm. - 02/23/01 - Dept. of Historic Resources - Lloyd House
One Wales Alley - Watauga Properties II, LLC - 05/30/01 - A H R P C - 104 S. Union St.

6